

Hartmut Möller (Rostock)

How Much Globalisation Can the European Music Historian Bear?

A Comment on the Contributions of Timothy Rice and Tim Taylor

This contribution is a comment on the papers of Timothy Rice and Tim Taylor from the perspective of a German musicologist. It consists of four parts:

- I. On the three-dimensional model of musical experience
- II. Different links between the local and the global
- III. Cosmopolitans and two kinds of cultural globalisation: Perspectives of those with names and those without names
- IV. How much globalisation can the European music historian bear?

I. On the Three-dimensional Model of Musical Experience

Thinking about identity and identities has to start from the subject and its ways of constructing identities. Therefore I agree with what Timothy Rice remarked on the single and the many subjects and their use of belief: »One can imagine a single subject employing many metaphors or claims about the nature of music in different nodes of place and time to make sense of musical experience and many subjects contesting the nature of music at the intersection of their individual spaces of music experience.«¹

As an example, I will take the ways of listening to the first concert of this congress.²

In the Weimar newspapers I found the reactions of two critics of this concert: Though they receive the concert at the same place and the same time, it affects different moments in their lives and different »Erlebniszeiten« (times of experience). And – above all – they use totally different metaphors to describe the nature of the music they heard. From two critiques of the opening concert of the congress:

Mit einem Raritäten-Konzert eröffnet der Int. Kongress [...] ein Programm, das seinen tieferen Sinn wohl nur im Kontext mit dem Kongress-Motto »Musik und kulturelle Identität« entfaltet. Es fiel schwer, den Werken mehr als Interesse entgegenzubringen. [...] Im Schlussstück der Eindruck eines farblich changierenden Films. Dem leider das Ziel fehlt: Der plötzliche Schluss bringt keine Lösung, er regt auf. Sollte darin die Absicht liegen?³

1 Timothy Rice, »Reflections on Musical Identity from the Perspective of Subject-centered Musical Ethnography«, this volume.

2 The program of the opening concert on 16th September 2004 in the congress centrum neue weimarhalle was: Michael Obst, *Transit* (for orchestra); Henri Duparc, *Mélodies* (6 Orchesterlieder), Jean Sibelius, 5th Symphony in E flat major op. 82. Staatskapelle Weimar, Peter Gülke (conductor), Claudia Barainsky (Soprano).

In der Tat war den gebotenen Werken ein Zug gemeinsam. Zu ihrem Wesen gehörte jeweils, dass sie sich auch in der Entfremdung nicht eigentlich vom Kern der Tonalität lösen. Und diese Bezogenheit auf ein harmonisches Zentrum ist unabhängig von den konkreten Werken noch immer Garant für eine spontane Identifikation, die der kulturell gebildete Hörer dann als Teil seiner selbst wahrnimmt und damit zu seiner eigenen Identität macht.⁴

The first critic seems to believe that music has to aim at a goal, at some kind of solution to be more than just »interesting«. Consequently, his musical experience was a kind of »flowing energy without any goal«. The only sense he could extract from the concert was its relation to the motto of the congress (even if there is no sense, the musicologists will find one!).

In contrast to his colleague, the second critic experienced a tonal center in all compositions, and this, as he speculated, guaranteed a »spontaneous identification« which the culturally educated listener perceives as a part of his own, making it to his own identity (a good example for our discussion: high educational capital and the self-definition of identity). From this point of view, the identity of the culturally educated listener and the »Leitidee« (the central theme) of the congress belong together. (Another example would be the concert with Osman art music on Saturday, the different experiences of the listeners.⁵)

Concerning Tim Rice's space model, I agree that there are dimensions of space, time and metaphor which are relevant when we think about musical experience. My critical question is: How specific is such a three-dimensional model for musical experience? And: Is it specific enough for the problem of musical experience? Or does this model only suggest some »Rahmenbedingungen« (some general conditions)? For Immanuel Kant, space and time are conditions for experience.⁶

For example, the three dimensions do not show that the different notions within each dimension themselves are situated in different dimensions, such as time of music, history, and music history, »Erlebniszeit« (experienced time) and »Lebenszeit« (lifetime).

We all know about the attraction of thinking and modelling in three dimensions in our western culture. But we should ask ourselves whether exactly these three dimensions are the only dimensions of musical experience, which we would answer in the negative, then, of course. This topic has often been dealt with on both sides of the Atlantic. In the discussion, we can perhaps talk about a possible space of musical experience of those who buy world music, where other dimensions play a crucial role. According to Tim Taylor, buyers of world music form a group with high educational capital, high financial status, and with the aesthetics of the city. They tend to be, as he said, more tolerant, more sophisticated, more

3 »Energieströme ohne Ziel: Konzert zum Musikkongress-Auftakt«, in: *Thüringische Landeszeitung* 18.9.04, Kultur p. 1.

4 »Die Leitidee: Gelungener Konzert-Auftakt beim Weimarer Kongress der Musikforscher«, in: *Thüringer Allgemeine* 18.9.04, Feuilleton p. 4.

5 The concert on 18th September 2004 in the Fürstenhaus of the Hochschule für Musik Franz Liszt Weimar was named »Osmanli Music of the Goethe Period«, played by the Ensemble Ayangil (Ruhi Ayangil, direction).

6 See the chapter »Die transzendente Ästhetik«, in: Immanuel Kant, *Kritik der reinen Vernunft* (1781), Darmstadt 1983, p. A19–49.

cosmopolitan, and more eclectic.⁷ A last remark on the box with its three rather general dimensions:⁸ Is music experience the only object we can put into this box? An example would be music history writing. From my own experience I would say that we can put different ways of music history, writing in a context like this, too – the same ›Rahmenbedingungen‹.

Finally, I suggest that it is necessary to find ways of leaving the three-dimensional model into the direction of a multi-faceted model which is more likely to correspond to the complicated reality of music-experiencing in a ›transcultural‹ world.

Talking about the space of musical experience does not automatically mean to talk about musical experience. In this respect, another question comes up: What does it mean if one says that musical identity is ›one kind‹ of musical experience? What is the underlying concept? Is this box filled with different kinds of musical experience – and one of them is ›musical identity‹? During this congress I have learnt that there is a huge ›Sprachverwirrung‹ (many misunderstandings due to language barriers) when we use concepts like culture, identity, and music – all can be used in plural versions. In one symposium on Saturday, 18 September, Hermann Kaiser has demonstrated that the question ›What is identity?‹ is highly problematic⁹. Instead we should ask how the term ›identity‹ is used.

In his lecture, Bassam Tibi showed that every person has identities (plural!) on two levels: subordinate identities and superordinate identities (everyday subjective identity – social production of meaning).¹⁰ This plurality of identities is also the topic of Hargreaves, which is quoted in the paper of Tim Rice. Music is a medium through which people can construct new identities.¹¹ (What should be discussed from this perspective is the idea of the ›precise homology between self-identity and music‹.)

On the three diagrams that Timothy Rice presents on his paper,¹² we find many arrows pointing into two directions: ›experiential tension‹. This refers to the plurality of identities: different identities in tension. In one quotation in Rice's article, Hargreaves states: ›We are ultimately social and not personal beings.‹¹³ This has to be thought over. Therefore we should perhaps say: there is a tension between social and individual identities.

II. Different Links between the Local and the Global

We can think of many musical experiences along the dimensions of time and location, for example: the first performance of a Beethoven symphony in a palace in Vienna; J. S. Bach and his small choir in the Leipzig St. Thomas Church; a musician in the street, and so on.

7 See Timothy D. Taylor, ›World Music Revisited‹, this volume, p. 150–152.

8 See Rice, ›Reflections on Musical Identity‹, p. 139–140.

9 See H. J. Kaiser, ›Kulturelle Identität als Grenzerfahrung‹, in: this publication, vol. 2, p. 140–148.

10 Bassam Tibi, ›Weltmusik und Weltpolitik im Zeitalter des Cultural Turn und der neuen Konstruktion kultureller Identitäten als ›Invention of Tradition‹‹, this volume.

11 Rice, ›Reflections on Musical Identity‹, p. 140.

12 Ibid., p. 142–143, figures 1–3.

13 David J. Hargreaves, Dorothy Miell and Raymond A. R. MacDonald ›What are Musical Identities, and Why are they Important?‹, in: Raymond A. R. MacDonald, David J. Hargreaves, and Dorothy Miell, *Musical Identities*, New York 2002, p. 10.

I will take two short examples from the city of Rostock, where I come from. The first example is from the 15th century – after the University of Rostock was founded (in 1419). In the second half of this century the *Rostocker Liederbuch* was put together, containing 60 songs and texts. One song, »Wach auf mein hort«, was written by Oswald von Wolkenstein in Tirol, Austria. This is a song about lovers in the morning. And the crucial question is: How did this song »move« from Tirol to Rostock?

Inter-regional transport of text and melody of a song in the 15th century

Tirol	Tirol Text + melody
Southern Germany Nürnberg	<i>Lochamer Liederbuch</i> , ca. 1455 Text and melody
Rostock	<i>Rostocker Liederbuch</i> (ca. 1465–1485) Local text areal/inter-regional melody

Text and melody – according to the existing sources – can be found at different times and places in the 15th century: in Tirol, in the region of Nürnberg, and in Rostock. The text has changed on the way from Tirol to Rostock, but the melody stayed more or less the same. So there are local versions of the text, with differences in language and content, but an inter-regional melody.¹⁴

My second example is the »Hansa-Hymne« of Hansa Rostock, the local football club. It is a combination of local text, local singer, but global style of music: in any case not regional, but German pop-»Schlager«-tradition with a melody close to church songs and an »international« rock arrangement¹⁵; from the Rostock-perspective, an »international« touch.

Local construction of Identity: hymn of Hansa Rostock

Social behavior	Singing together, arm in arm
Symbol	»Ewig« hymn style
Style	»International« pop/rock language
Text	»Wir«, Hansa Rostock

The production did not use »Schifferklavier« (harmonica) or shanty-choir, but an international rock/pop style. Maybe this is used to give the music a meaning which denies local and regional peculiarities. (This might correspond to Tim Taylor's idea of metropolitan aesthetics: world music as the musical analogue to globalisation – in the case of Rostock: rock/pop as an analogue to »internationality«.)

14 Franz-J. Holznagel and Hartmut Möller, »Ein Fall von Interregionalität. Oswald von Wolkenstein »Wach auf, mein Hort«, in: *Zeitschrift für deutsche Philologie* 122 (2003), p. 102–133.

15 I thank Mr. Winfried Lüdemann for his remark after my contribution: The »Hansa-Hymne« reminds him the hymn *Halleluja*: »Suchet zuerst Gottes Reich in der Welt« (Evangelisches Kirchengesangbuch Nr. 182). Indeed, the main notes of the refrain are comparable (*d-c sharp-b-a*) as well as the gestus of a hymn, like the Queen's *We Are the Champions*.

III. Cosmopolitans and Two Kinds of Cultural Globalisation

Tim Taylor talks about the conception of a new kind of aesthetic reflexivity in the so-called developed countries. He discusses the relatively recent formation of a new social group, grounded on educational and/or cultural capital. According to Ulf Hannerz, this is a group with a »willingness to engage with the Other – a new configuration of the older category of the cosmopolitan«.¹⁶ I find it very interesting to bring together world music and this group in the cities, for whom world music is a sign of the globalising world. This concept of a new kind of cosmopolitan is contrary to the idea which I heard in the first roundtable: the cosmopolitan who is travelling between the cultures and who is not at home in any culture – in contrast to the person, who really has identity.

An example for this new type of cosmopolitan is the musician and producer Arto Lindsay. He was born in the United States, raised in Brazil, and since 1978 he is a key figure in Downtown Manhattan. I have a music example from Lindsay, from 1996, with which we can test Tim Rice's idea of the symbolic meaning of the musical parameters: As he said, the multiple elements of music »can point symbolically in different directions in a way that reveals the multi-faceted nature of self-identities in the modern world.«¹⁷ This piece is a combination of traditional Brazilian rhythmic instruments, samples by the DJ Spooky and Mutamassik, Bass and drum-machine – produced in the city of New York.¹⁸ Arto Lindsay himself is joking on the question of closed identity. He favours transcultural identity, and he is interested in the parallels between the two Americas: both are, as he says, cultures who had slaves, both are cultures of emigration.

Cosmopolitans like Arto Lindsay can be linked to the type of globalisation, which Dieter Senghaas, a »Friedensforscher« (peace researcher) from Bremen, calls »Globalisierung de luxe«. In the rich countries, cultural exchange is praised as a »Bereicherung«, an enrichment. And there are different types of hybrid cultures, cross-overs, etc. These processes are »kulturell aufregend« (culturally exciting), but politically »weitgehend bedeutungslos« (almost meaningless). Whereas in other parts of the world, culture from outside is often seen as an opponent to the own culture, which indicates a problematic cultural identity. There is an asymmetric cultural »Verdrängungswettbewerb« – a competition of colonization. The result is a resistance to globalisation on different levels.¹⁹ Tim Rice talked about »the diversity of experience available today to virtually everyone in the world«²⁰ – from the American-European perspective, of course. But there are other perspectives in the world, and there are people who resist to the experience of western diversities – in the name of the many without a name.

16 Ulf Hannerz, *Transnational Connections: Culture, People, Places*, New York 1996, p. 103.

17 Rice, »Reflections on Musical Identity«, p. 144.

18 See Arto Lindsay, »Horizontal«, in: *Mundo Civilizado*, CD Ryoko 10410 (1996).

19 Dieter Senghaas, *Zivilisierung wider Willen: Der Konflikt der Kulturen mit sich selbst*, Frankfurt a.M. 1998; Dieter Senghaas, *Zum irdischen Frieden*, Frankfurt a.M. 2004; see also: *Vom hörbaren Frieden*, ed. by Hartmut Lück and Dieter Senghaas, Frankfurt a.M. 2005.

20 Rice, »Reflections on Musical Identity«, p. 139.

In 1992, Roland Robertson, a sociologist from Pittsburgh University, invented the term »Glocalisation« for cultural processes in space and time. »Glocalisations« are combinations of the local and the global: Globalization + Localization = »Glocalization«.²¹

First possibility: the way from local to global, that is: local elements become global;

Second possibility: global cultural phenomena are transferred into the local, get local colour; e.g. local variants of global pop music.

In their recent study on Russian youth cultures, Dirk Villányi and Matthias D. Witte show on which paths Western culture comes to Russia and how different this is received by young people.²² There are very different opinions about Western influence, which could be grouped as following:

1. First group: Russia is already part of a global youth culture but, unfortunately, the cultural exchange is one-sided, from west to east.
2. Second group: Russia should assimilate much more to the American way of life.
3. Third group: The otherness of Russian culture, resistance against Americanisation.
4. Fourth group: Contrary to the so-called Western culture, which is only superficial and commercial, the Russian culture is rich and on high level.

These are reactions of young Russian people to the cultural input from the West – reactions in view of processes of glocalisation.²³ Dirk Villányi and Matthias Witte present good arguments for the use of the term »local clashes« of culture – in St. Petersburg, as well as anywhere else in the world.

IV. How Much Globalisation Can The European Music Historian Bear?

The philosopher Rüdiger Safranski has written a book titled: *Wieviel Globalisierung verträgt der Mensch?* (How Much Globalisation Can We Bear?²⁴) Safranski argues that the omnipresence of information from anywhere in the world leads to a loss of connection to the place where people work and live: »Der Sinnkreis ist durch Medienprothesen künstlich erweitert, und er hat sich vollkommen vom Handlungskreis losgelöst.« Safranski says: what we need today is a »cultural filter-system«, the power of finding ways of self-restriction against an overwhelming input from outside. »Was tust Du gegen das Ozonloch, gegen den weltweiten Terrorismus, gegen die Kinderarbeit in Ost-Timor, gegen die Unterdrückung der Oguschen? – So etwas hält auf die Dauer kein Mensch aus.«

What is the situation of musicology? Are we greeting globalisation, being in the situation of a globalisation de luxe? Or are we in a situation that can be described by a question of Safranski: »How much globalisation is bearable by the musicologist?« Is there a need to tell

21 Roland Robertson, »Glocalisation: Time-Space and Homogeneity-Heterogeneity«, in: *Global Modernities*, ed. by Mike Featherstone, Scott Lash and Robert Robertson, London 1995, p. 25–44.

22 Dirk Villányi and Matthias D. Witte, »Jugendkulturen zwischen Globalisierung und Ethnisierung. Glocal Clash – Der Kampf des Globalen im Lokalen am Beispiel Russlands«, in: *Zeitschrift für Erziehungswissenschaft* 7 (2004), p. 58–70.

23 According to the study by Hilary Pilkington, *Russia's Youth and its Culture: A Nation's Constructors and Constructed*, London 1994.

24 Rüdiger Safranski, *Wieviel Globalisierung verträgt der Mensch?*, München 2003.

other stories than the usual ones in order to place European music history in a global perspective – decentred and treated as just one of many kinds of musics, of course. Are we looking for a balance of the different elements of such a future integrated history? Are we able to accept the otherness and to integrate it in our histories? Are we willing to take part in different musical cultures, and to bring these experiences into our musicological books? What has to be changed to write histories, which do not only deal with great composers and their works, but also integrate composers of the second rank; which deals with women composers, popular musics, music performance, daily musical life, etc., and also with the areas of »Verdrängen, Vertreiben, Verstummen« (displacement, dismissal, becoming silent)? What kind of book and how many volumes of it should there be, and why should people read it? Or should we continue writing different kinds of torn-up partial histories side by side, in our specialized fields, pieces of histories in parallel universes?

In his lecture, Bassam Tibi argued in the following direction: It is not enough to play Beethoven together; we have to deal with problems, talking on the same level. The clash of civilisations exists, and we have to look for peaceful ways of trying to solve the problems.

In any case, Safranski's question of how much globalisation we can bear should be not taken as an excuse not to contribute to the openness of a »transcultural« network.